

Paper F1

Faith and order committee
Joint declaration on justification

United
Reformed
Church
Church 2016
2016
Church 2016



Paper F1

Faith and Order Committee Joint Declaration on the Doctrine of Justification

Basic Information

Contact name and email address	Before Mission Council: The Revd Elizabeth Welch minister@theroundchapel.org.uk After Mission Council: The Revd Dr Alan Spence alanandsheila@googlemail.com
Action required	Decision
Draft resolution(s)	<p>a) Mission Council welcomes the fact that the World Communion of Reformed Churches is considering association with the <i>Joint Declaration on the Doctrine of Justification</i>.</p> <p>b) Acting on behalf of General Assembly, Mission Council instructs the Faith and Order Committee to communicate the United Reformed Church's warm and strong support for this association.</p>

Summary of Content

Subject and aim(s)	The URC should support the proposal that the World Communion of Reformed Churches associate with the <i>Joint Declaration on the Doctrine of Justification</i> .
Main points	As above.
Previous relevant documents	None in our councils.
Consultation has taken place with...	European Council of World Communion of Reformed Churches.

Summary of Impact

Financial	Nil.
External (e.g. ecumenical)	Gain and growth in our contact with international partners in our own and several other Christian traditions.

Joint Declaration on the Doctrine of Justification

1. United Reformed Christians look back on the European Reformation of the sixteenth century with both gratitude and grief. We are grateful that Christians of that era found fresh confidence in important truths of the gospel, and that these have been handed on in our tradition across the generations. We grieve, however, that the Reformation divided the Church, for these divisions between denominations have also become part of our heritage.

2. The division in continental Europe between the Lutheran and Roman Catholic churches has been particularly blatant. Martin Luther's protest in 1517 both refreshed and split European church life. The churches that owe most to him split away from the Roman Catholic Church at that time, and have been divided from the Catholics ever since.

3. A major theme in Luther's writing was justification – how people can be right with God. It is a biblical idea, and was very important to Luther. It then became a core idea in the churches that he led, and has remained so through five centuries. Rightly or wrongly, it has seemed to many to be the big divisive issue – the main point that kept Lutherans and Catholics apart, because they thought of it in different ways. After the mid-1500s little was done to explore and address that apparently deep disagreement.

4. Churches of our Reformed tradition do not belong directly to the Lutheran strand of church life. But some would see our tradition as an offshoot of Luther's movement, and certainly we have always been closer to the Lutherans than to the Catholics. Like the Lutherans, we are children of the Reformation. Like them, we have had much to say about justification, and a great deal of this has resonated with what Luther said. Christians are justified by God's grace, through the death of Christ, and receive this right relationship with God through faith – these have been major themes of Reformed preaching.

5. There was a cautious coming together of Lutherans and Catholics from the 1960s onwards. Leaders and theologians of the two sides started to explore common ground, and by the 1990s they were ready to ask whether the big issue of justification need remain as divisive as it had been in the past. They decided it need not. In 1999 the Lutheran World Federation and the Roman Catholic Church drew up a *Joint Declaration on the Doctrine of Justification*. This seemed to be a major landmark, a healing and reconciliation of an ancient division. Support for the *Joint Declaration* has since come from other quarters too, from the World Methodist Council in 2006 and from the Anglican Consultative Council in 2016. What, then, about the Reformed family? Would we like to associate with the *Joint Declaration* too?

6. In the last few years the World Communion of Reformed Churches has asked this very question: shall we associate with the *Joint Declaration*? The Communion's proposed answer is yes, and it has drafted a document of association. Now it wants to know what its member churches think about the matter. With a Luther quincentenary coming up in 2017 – which would be a symbolic moment to declare our support – time is pressed. Member churches have been given a few weeks to make up our mind, and must reply by the end of October.

7. Members of Mission Council may read the WCRC's draft document of association as an appendix to this paper. The *Joint Declaration* itself, and the WCRC's information letter to

member churches inviting us to consider this matter, may be found at the following address, then scroll down to 'Resources': www.wcrc.ch/jddj

8. Our Faith and Order Committee has considered the draft, and now asks for the mandate of Mission Council to reply warmly and positively. The Committee believes it would be very good for the World Communion to associate with the *Joint Declaration*.

9. A particular concern of the World Communion has been to stress the link between justification and justice. Justification concerns the way that people relate to God. Justice is about the way people relate to one another. If I care about one, I ought not to ignore the other. God's grace stirs me to love my neighbour. 'The fruits of a justified life' (to use a Reformed slogan) include a passion for truth and right in God's world. This is a significant part of the WCRC's draft response to the *Joint Declaration*.

10. However, the Faith and Order Committee would also like our Church's reply to the World Communion to be more than a simple word of support. It should include warm support, but the Committee would also like to write a covering letter. Among the points the Committee would be keen to make are the following.

11. We do not talk much about justification in the URC – not nearly as much as some of us can remember from a few decades ago. But even if we do not use the word itself, we need and value the truth it expresses. It affirms the hope and confidence that rise out of Christian belief; it is doctrine of assurance and challenge in a world of pain and anger; it energises and motivates us to care about right relationships, for Christ's sake. Therefore we welcome and strongly support the connection made by the World Communion between justification and justice. We hope that associating with the *Joint Declaration* will be more than a landmark for the world's Reformed churches. We shall rejoice if it can be a signpost to a journey, and to fresh exploration and discovery of the resources and challenge of the grace of God.

12. The Committee hopes that Mission Council will support the resolution, and that it will be content for the Committee to draft a covering letter, along the lines set out above. Members of Mission Council who have further points to suggest for the letter should write, by 27th October at latest, to the Revd Dr Alan Spence. alanandsheila@googlemail.com



LIVING GOD
RENEW AND
TRANSFORM US

World Communion of Reformed Churches

Called to communion, committed to justice

F1

United Reformed Church • Mission Council, October 2016

Revised Draft:

Association of the World Communion of Reformed Churches with the Joint Declaration on the Doctrine of Justification

[August 2016]

Preamble

1. In recent years a welcome degree of convergence on the doctrine of justification has been achieved. In 1999, after many years of committed dialogue, the Joint Declaration on the Doctrine of Justification was signed by the Catholic Church and the Lutheran World Federation. This agreement, on what had been a central church dividing issue at the time of the Reformation, is a landmark achievement which we celebrate. In 2006, the World Methodist Council and its member churches affirmed their fundamental doctrinal agreement with the teaching expressed in the Joint Declaration on the Doctrine of Justification. The World Communion of Reformed Churches, after extended consideration and special attention to connections between justification and justice, now joyfully accepts the invitation to associate with the Joint Declaration on the Doctrine of Justification (JDDJ). For the Reformed, justification by grace through faith is an essential teaching of the gospel.

2. We affirm our fundamental doctrinal agreement with the teaching expressed in the JDDJ, and we express profound gratitude for the great advance that has been made in this ecumenical consensus. We rejoice together that the historical doctrinal differences on the doctrine of justification no longer divide us, and we experience this as a moment of self-examination, conversion and new commitment to one another manifesting new unity and advancing our common witness for peace and justice. In keeping with the Reformed principle, "*ecclesia reformata, semper reformanda secundum verbum dei*," we embrace the new reality this shared agreement promises. We hope to not only affirm but also enrich and extend the existing degree of consensus. We embrace the model of differentiated consensus and the openness, diversity and richness of theological language it makes possible. We will here add our distinctive emphases to those already shared by others. We anticipate areas that invite further dialogue and clarification. We acknowledge the importance, in ecumenical dialogue, of listening to one another and listening to Scripture together.

3. There is a long and interesting history of dialogue on the matter of justification among Reformed, Lutheran and Catholic communions. In fact, a remarkable consensus on basic elements of the doctrine of justification was declared in the Regensburg Agreement of 1541 (Article V *de iustificatione*).¹ Calvin warmly welcomed this agreement (*Letter to Farel* 11.5.1541). However, because of the confessional struggle, the efforts failed and the agreement was nearly forgotten for more than 450 years.

We hear the consensus and agree.

4. We agree with the common affirmation that justification is the work of the triune God. The good news of the gospel is that God has reconciled the world to himself through the Son and in the Spirit. Justification presupposes and is grounded in the incarnation, death and resurrection of Christ. Justification means that Christ himself is our “righteousness (δικαιοσύνη – justice) and sanctification and redemption” (1 Cor. 1:30). According to Reformed understanding, justification and sanctification, which cannot be separated, both flow from union with Christ.

Entering into union with him through the Holy Spirit, by means of word and sacrament, we receive a share in his saving righteousness. By grace alone, through faith in Christ’s saving work—and not because of any merit on our part—we are accepted by God. In Christ the Spirit renews our hearts while equipping us to do the good works that God has prepared for us to walk in. (§15)

5. We also agree that God calls all people to salvation in Christ. When we receive this salvation by grace through faith, we are justified by Christ alone. Faith is God’s gift through the Holy Spirit. By word and sacrament in the community of faith, the Spirit leads believers into that renewal of life which God will bring to completion in eternal life. (§16)

6. We further agree that the message of justification directs us in a special way to the heart of the biblical witness. Based on God’s saving action in Christ, justification tells us “that as sinners our new life is due solely to God’s forgiving and renewing mercy. This mercy is imparted to us as a gift, which we receive through faith, and never can merit in any way.” (§17)

7. We agree with both Catholics and Lutherans that the doctrine of justification has a central place among the essential doctrines of Christian faith. It is an indispensable criterion for teaching and practice in the life of the church. We also affirm that historic differences in emphasis and interpretation on this doctrine are not a sufficient cause for division between them or between either party and the Reformed. (§18)

We particularly appreciate some of the distinctive insights in the JDDJ.

8. We appreciate the recognition in the JDDJ that we are powerless to save ourselves, incapable of turning to God on our own, and that the freedom we know is not freedom for salvation. Our response to God’s grace is itself the effect of God’s grace working in us. What Christ has accomplished by his saving obedience (*extra nos*) is made known and applied in us (*in nobis*) by the Spirit especially through God’s word and the sacraments of baptism and the Lord’s Supper. No one can respond to God’s call apart from God’s prior work of grace. (§19-21)

9. We appreciate the recognition that sin is both a guilt and a power; thus, God’s grace brings both forgiveness and liberation. God’s forgiveness absolves us of our guilt (justification) and God’s liberation frees us from bondage to sin so that our faith might be active in love (sanctification). Union with Christ, according to Reformed teaching, is the source of these two saving benefits. Sanctification does not entail attaining perfection in this life. We recognize the ongoing struggle—our situation of being at the same time justified and a sinner. Nevertheless, we believe that in our union with Christ “day by day, more and more” we are being conformed to his image and grow in grace. According to Reformed understanding, it is through our participation in Christ by faith that we receive a saving share in his righteousness before God (justification) and receive the gift of new life (sanctification) to be instruments of God’s love.). (§22-24)

10. We appreciate the clear presentation that sinners are justified by grace through faith (Eph. 2:8) and that faith is active in love. Grace is the source and ground of justification while faith is the instrument of its reception. The whole of the Christian life is a life of trust in the promises of God. Such faith cannot truly exist without love and hope in God. Union with Christ by faith entails both justification by grace and sanctification or growing in grace. “Faith is active in love and thus the Christian cannot and should not remain without works.” Faith without works is dead (Jas. 2:17). Love for God and the neighbour is therefore indispensable to faith. “But whatever in the justified precedes or follows the free gift of faith is neither the basis of justification nor merits it.” The grace we receive brings renewal of life. (§25-27)

11. We appreciate the honest recognition that even though we are justified we nevertheless continue a lifelong struggle against the contradiction to God which we must continually repent and for which we daily ask forgiveness in the Lord’s Prayer. This struggle, however, does not separate us from God in Christ. We remain ever dependent on God’s grace, through word and sacrament, throughout our lives. Grace never becomes something we merely possess. (§28-30).

The Reformed have particular emphases and additional insights to bring.

12. The Reformed agree with the strong conviction expressed that the law is fulfilled in Christ and is not a “way of salvation” for us. The law discloses our sin to us and leads us to seek God’s mercy in Christ. At the same time, we understand that it is the teaching and example of Christ (who fulfilled the law) that remains the norm for life in Christ. For this reason, the Reformed maintain that the commandments of God remain valid for us in our lives as believers. This is the guiding role of the law, sometimes referred to as “the third use of the law.” This is the primary use in Reformed understanding—even more central than the first two: the “civil” use (to curb wrongdoing in the public arena) or the “pedagogical” use in convicting of sin. “Law and gospel” are not sharply contrasted but viewed as connected by their grounding in God’s grace. This sense of connection between law and gospel echoes a Reformed emphasis on the continuity (rather than contrast) between the Old Testament and the New Testament as one covenant of grace. For the Reformed *sola scriptura* entails *tota scriptura*. Both law and gospel are God’s good gifts to us. The law is God’s gracious provision of a guide for living. Reformed sensibilities concerning the law resonate with those expressed in Psalm 19, “The law of the Lord is perfect, reviving the soul; the decrees of the Lord are sure, making wise the simple; the precepts of the Lord are right, rejoicing the heart; the commandment of the Lord is clear enlightening the eyes....” The renewal of life (sanctification) that accompanies justification strengthens us to live (more fully) in gratitude and joyful obedience to God. This is a gift of God’s grace at work in our lives. We may have confidence that the good work God has begun in us will be brought to completion. “Through Jesus Christ God has mercifully promised to his children the grace of eternal life.” (§31-33)

13. We affirm the testimony given here to the utter reliability of the promises of God. We witness to the irrevocability of the gifts and calling of God (Rom. 11:29). God’s covenant of grace given to Israel is unbroken and is extended to us by faith in Christ. The gift of faith provides us assurance of salvation. Faith without assurance would be deficient or confused. Assurance is not based upon anything in ourselves—whether faith, works or evidences of the Holy Spirit—but upon the promises of God. Our God is a faithful God who keeps covenant with the people of God through the ages. God’s electing grace at work in the people of Israel is now at work in us also through Christ. For assurance we look to Christ and the promises of God in him. In times of doubt, temptation and anxiety we do not look to ourselves but to Christ. For the Reformed, assurance of salvation is particularly linked to the doctrine of election. Divine election is grounded solely in God’s electing grace. In the doctrine of election we recognize God who chose us in Christ before the foundation of the world (Eph. 1:4). We have nothing that we have not received. Even our capacity to respond to God is God’s gift to us. So

also, is our perseverance in faith. These insights evoke humility and gratitude in believers and provide assurance of salvation. God's calling and God's promises are sure. In Christ God has promised our salvation, and "the objective reality of God's promise" which cannot be considered untrustworthy grounds our assurance of salvation. (§34-36)

14. We value the careful nuancing of the place of good works among the justified. They are the fruit (and not the root) of justification. Good works reflect the effect of God's grace in us; faith that is active in love. Good works can only be done in dependence upon God's grace. The Reformed would add here a comment on how we have interpreted the place of good works among the justified. In the Second Helvetic Confession (Chapter XVI, paragraph 6) there is an explication which clarifies that good works are not done in order to earn eternal life, or for ostentation, or for gain. Rather they are "for the glory of God, to adorn our calling, to show gratitude to God, and for the profit of the neighbour." In this way, we have further elaborated the place of good works among the justified. (§37-39)

We wish to underscore the integral relation between justification and justice.

15. We wish to add a word on the relation we see between justification and justice. In 2001, representatives of the Catholic Church, the Lutheran World Federation, the World Methodist Council and the World Alliance of Reformed Churches met in Columbus, Ohio, to discuss the prospect of widening participation in the JDDJ. The thoughtful and constructive conversation held at the consultation led the Reformed to a deepened reflection on the JDDJ and to a commitment to inquire into one of our key questions: What is the relation between justification and justice? The similarity in terms invites reflection upon the nature of their connection. In the New Testament, the same Greek term (*δικαιοσύνη, dikaiosyne*) is used to convey both. It can be translated either as "righteousness" or as "justice." We began a series of consultations in our regional contexts about the nature of this connection. Our further discussions have been most profitable and we offer, in the paragraphs which follow, a few insights that have emerged.

16. For the Reformed, justice is not simply the ethical outworking of justification as a kind of second step; rather it is already entailed theologically in justification as such. This insight has now been elaborated in the final report of the fourth phase of the International Reformed–Catholic Dialogue, *Justification and Sacramentality: The Christian Community as an Agent of Justice*, "That both of these meanings are conveyed with the same word reflects the fact that they are profoundly related. The one who is justified by faith is called to act in a righteous way. As a consequence, the doctrine of justification cannot be seen in the abstract, divorced from the reality of injustice, oppression and violence in today's world" (paragraph 56). Justification is, both a "declaring righteous" and a "setting right." This insight may be at the root of John Calvin's insistence that justification and sanctification are inseparable (*Institutes*, III.2.1); they are to be thought of as a two-fold grace (*duplex gratia*).² We acknowledge that the discussion of justification (in JDDJ 4.2) as entailing both "forgiveness of sins" and "renewal of life" points in this direction. We also welcome the invitation offered in paragraph 43 to further clarification of "the relation between justification and social ethics." In what follows, the Reformed intend an initial offering on this relation.

17. In the Reformed emphasis on the sovereignty of God, we have affirmed that God is sovereign over all of life (not just the narrowly religious or spiritual aspects of individual lives). We affirm with the Psalmist that "The earth is the Lord's and the fullness thereof, the world and those that dwell therein" (24:1, KJV). God has entered into covenant with all of creation (Gen. 9:8-12), and God's covenant of grace intends a "setting right" that is world-embracing—including even political, economic and ecological realities. All of God's covenantal acts are acts of justification and justice. This emphasis has been lately underscored in the Accra Confession (Covenanting for Justice in the Economy and the Earth): "God has brought into being an earth community based on the vision of justice

and peace....Jesus shows that this is an inclusive covenant in which the poor and marginalized are preferential partners, and calls us to put justice for the 'least of these' (Mt 25.40) at the centre of the community of life. All creation is blessed and included in this covenant (Hos 2.18ff)" (paragraph 20).

18. This way of thinking has also been welcomed by the present partners. In the most recent dialogue with the Lutheran World Federation (*Communion: On Being the Church*, paragraph 56) we have affirmed, "There is no area in life, indeed in all creation which does not belong to Jesus Christ who sends us into all the world to be a sign of God's kingdom to preach and live the gospel of reconciliation in a common concern for justice, freedom, peace and care for the creation."³ Similarly, in the final report of the fourth phase of the International Reformed-Catholic Dialogue (*Justification and Sacramentality: The Christian Community as an Agent of Justice*), we together affirmed: "the theological doctrine and reality of justification by faith and sanctification impels the Christian community to act on behalf of justice. The imperative for justice flows necessarily from justification and from the call of the whole Church to holiness" (paragraph 79).

19. There is a sense in which justification and sanctification may be thought of as ordered toward justice. In God's saving work things are being "set right" in lives. We are drawn into right relationship with God and into the true worship of God (*soli deo gloria*). The true worship of God finds concrete manifestation in striving for justice and righteousness in society. Thus we are drawn into the work of setting things right in the larger social world. Calvin affirmed that "believers truly worship God by the righteousness they maintain within their society" (*Commentary on Matthew*, 12:7).

20. We maintain that "the doctrine of justification cannot be seen in the abstract, divorced from the reality of injustice, oppression and violence in today's world" (*Justification and Sacramentality: The Christian Community as an Agent of Justice* paragraph 56)." In the message and ministry of Jesus justice was central. This becomes even more obvious when we remember the frequency of the Greek term *dikaiosyne* in the gospels and realize that (as noted above) in the many places where it is translated "righteousness" it could equally well have been translated as "justice." The Belhar Confession expresses the imperative of resisting injustice even more strongly. In Christ, God is revealed "as the one who wishes to bring about justice and true peace among people... . We reject any ideology which would legitimate forms of injustice and any doctrine which is unwilling to resist such an ideology in the name of the gospel" (paragraph 4).

21. The doctrine of justification is vitally important for the Reformed. Calvin spoke of it as "the main hinge on which religion turns" (*Institutes*, III.2.1). We view it as being in essential connection with other doctrines. Our unity around this central doctrine is to be celebrated. We are grateful that Lutheran and Reformed Churches in some countries have recognized one another as belonging to the one Church of Jesus Christ and have declared full communion of pulpit and table. It is our deep hope that in the near future we shall also be able to enter into closer relationship with Lutherans in other places and with the Catholic Church, as well as with Methodists, in accordance with this declaration of our common understanding of the doctrine of justification.

Official Common Affirmation

In this Statement the World Communion of Reformed Churches affirms fundamental doctrinal agreement with the teaching expressed in the Joint Declaration on the Doctrine of Justification signed at Augsburg on 31 October 1999 on behalf of the Lutheran World Federation and the Catholic Church. The World Methodist Council affirmed their fundamental doctrinal agreement on 23 July 2006.

The signing partners of the Joint Declaration on the Doctrine of Justification join together in welcoming the above Statement of the World Communion of Reformed Churches which declares and demonstrates Reformed agreement with the consensus on basic truths of the doctrine of justification as expressed in the Joint Declaration on the Doctrine of Justification.

Building on their shared affirmation of basic truths of the doctrine of justification, the four parties commit themselves to strive together for the deepening of their common understanding of justification in theological study, teaching and preaching.

The present achievement and commitment are viewed by Catholics, Lutherans, Methodists and Reformed as part of their pursuit of the full communion and common witness to the world which is the will of Christ for all Christians.

¹ In the Article V *de iustificatione* Catholic, Lutheran and Reformed theologians (Contarini, Eck, Gropper, Melancthon, Bucer, Calvin) stated:

“But this happens to no one unless also at the same time love is infused [*infundatur*] which heals the will so that the healed may begin to fulfil the law, just as Saint Augustine [De spir. et lit., c. 9,15] said. So living faith is that which both appropriates mercy in Christ, believing that the righteousness which is in Christ is freely imputed to it, and at the same time receives the promise of the Holy Spirit and love. *Therefore the faith that truly justifies is that faith which is effectual through love* [Gal. 5:6]. Nevertheless it remains true that it is by this faith that we are justified (i.e. accepted and reconciled to God) inasmuch as it appropriates the mercy and righteousness which is imputed to us on account of Christ and his merit, not on account of the worthiness or perfection of the righteousness imparted [*communicatae*] to us in Christ.” (Translated by Anthony N. S. Lane, *Justification by Faith in Catholic-Protestant Dialogue. An Evangelical Assessment*, London/New York 2002, 234-235).